

Adaptive Logics and Dynamic Proofs.
Mastering the Dynamics of Reasoning,
with Special Attention to Handling Inconsistency.

Diderik Batens

October 11, 2010

Contents

Preface	1
1 Introduction	7
1.1 What is an Adaptive Logic?	7
1.2 Dynamic Reasoning Forms	12
1.3 Specific Features	17
1.4 Languages	19
1.5 Static Proofs	21
1.6 Semantics for Logics that Have Static Proofs	30
1.7 Classical Logic	31
2 Example: Handling Inconsistency	37
2.1 A Paradigmatic Problem	37
2.2 A Regular Paraconsistent Logic	39
2.3 Enter Dynamics	46
2.3.1 A Failing Strategy	48
2.3.2 The Reliability Strategy	52
2.3.3 The Minimal Abnormality Strategy	55
2.3.4 The Predicative Cases	58
2.3.5 Final Derivability	58
2.4 Semantics	59
2.5 The Classical Symbols	60
2.6 Concluding Comments	62
2.7 Appendix: Proof of Theorems 1.5.9 and 1.5.10	63
3 Example: Inductive Generalization	69
3.1 Promises	69
3.2 A First Logic of Inductive Generalization	71
3.3 Heuristic Matters and Further Comments	77
3.4 Two Alternatives	80
3.5 Combined Adaptive Logics	86
3.6 Handling Background Knowledge	97
3.7 Conjectures	104
3.8 Some Comments in Conclusion	106

4	The Standard Format	109
4.1	Introduction	109
4.2	The Definition	111
4.3	Excursion on the Classical Symbols	116
4.4	Proofs	119
4.5	Semantics	124
4.6	The Upper Limit Logic	125
4.7	Dynamic Proofs	126
4.8	Adaptive Dynamic Proofs	130
4.9	. . . and Dialogues	131
4.9.1	Reliability	133
4.9.2	Minimal Abnormality	137
4.9.3	Excursion: Classical Disjunctions in <i>Dab</i> -formulas	139
4.10	Dynamic Semantics	140
4.11	Modifications to Adaptive Logics from Previous Chapters	148
5	Metatheory of The Standard Format	149
5.1	Some Facts about Choice Sets	150
5.2	Strong Reassurance	154
5.3	Soundness and Completeness	156
5.4	The Adequacy of Final Derivability	159
5.5	Punctual Uniformity	162
5.6	Some Further Properties	165
5.7	Equivalent Premise Sets	176
5.8	Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic	182
5.9	Border Cases	184
5.10	Some Negative Theorems	187
6	Strategies and Combinations	191
6.1	Other Strategies	191
6.1.1	Simple	191
6.1.2	Blindness	194
6.1.3	Normal Selections	194
6.1.4	The Flip-flop Strategy	196
6.1.5	Counting	197
6.2	Combined Adaptive Logics	200
6.2.1	Unions of Sets of Abnormalities	201
6.2.2	Sequential Superpositions	205
6.2.3	Examples and Metatheoretic Problems	217
6.2.4	Closed Unions of Consequence Sets	229
6.2.5	Ordered Fusions of Adaptive Logics	237
7	More Ways to Handle Inconsistency	241
7.1	The Need for Variants	241
7.2	Some More Regular Paraconsistent Logics	242
7.3	The Corresponding Adaptive Logics	247
7.4	As Normal As Possible	255
7.5	Identifying Inconsistent Objects	263

8	Corrective Adaptive Logics	269
8.1	Not Only Inconsistency-Adaptive Logics	269
8.2	Variants and Combinations	278
8.3	Ambiguity-Adaptive Logics	283
8.4	Adaptive Zero Logic	289
8.5	Strength of Paraconsistency and Ambiguity	291
8.6	Flip-flop Criteria	292
9	Integration within the Adaptive Program	303
9.1	Aim	303
9.2	Compatibility	304
9.3	Inconsistent Compatibility	305
9.4	Integrating Normal Selections	305
9.5	Integrating the Flip-flop Strategy	306
9.6	Integrating Counting	306
9.7	Rescher–Manor	307
9.8	RM and their Enrichment	308
9.8.1	Aim	308
9.8.2	A Failure	308
9.8.3	A Second Failure	308
9.8.4	Other Proposal / Heuristic Considerations	308
9.9	Direct Proofs	310
9.10	Formula-Preferential Systems	310
10	Computational and Philosophical	311
10.1	Computational Complexity	311
10.2	Criteria for Final Derivability	314
10.3	Criteria: Tableau Methods	314
10.3.1	Tableaux for the Lower Limit Logic	315
10.3.2	Tableaux for the Adaptive Logics	317
10.4	Criteria: Proof Procedures	326
10.4.1	Reliability	327
10.4.2	Minimal Abnormality	327
10.5	Reasoning in the Absence of a Criterion	328
10.6	Interesting Open Problems	328
	References	329
	Note on the Index	339
	Index	340
A	afspraken Dirk + TE DOEN	349
A.1	talen	350
A.2	Add: Defeasible Reasoning and Adaptive Logics	350
A.3	Urgent: REVISE	350
A.4	NIET VERGETEN	351
A.5	GP	351

B	Notes on Some Concepts *	353
B.1	The Consequence Relation	353
B.2	Proofs	355
B.3	Semantics	356
C	Notes	357
C.1	Consistency by Brute Force	357
C.2	Extensional Logics	357
C.3	Infinite proofs	357
C.4	Troubles with $\Phi(\Gamma)$	358
C.4.1	Infinite extensions required	358
C.4.2	Uncountable $\Phi(\Gamma)$	358
C.4.3	Need the proof be infinite?	359
C.4.4	The Way Premise sets are Given	361
C.4.5	Criteria for Uncountable $\Phi(\Gamma)$	361
C.5	Arguments for Inserting Lines	363
C.6	Examples of Simple Defeasible Mechanisms	363
C.7	Interpretation of Expectancies	363
D	More Notes	365
D.1	Henkin and Compactness	365
D.2	Prospective Dynamics and Axiom schemata	366
D.3	Content-Guided Choice of an Adaptive Logic	366
D.4	Adaptive Logics Defined by Rules	368
D.5	Relation with argumentation	368
E	Verwijderd	369
E.1	Idea behind the Technical Treatment	369
E.2	Flip-flops: stuk uit flipflop-afdeling	371
E.3	LP flip-flop / deels fout	374
E.4	Tijdelijk	375
E.5	Direct bewijs van Corr. 5.6.3	376
E.6	oude versie eigenschappen	377