

**Adaptive Logics and Dynamic Proofs.**  
Mastering the Dynamics of Reasoning,  
with Special Attention to Handling Inconsistency.

Diderik Batens

October 11, 2010



# Contents

<b>Preface</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>7</b>
1.1 What is an Adaptive Logic? . . . . .	7
1.2 Dynamic Reasoning Forms . . . . .	12
1.3 Specific Features . . . . .	17
1.4 Languages . . . . .	19
1.5 Static Proofs . . . . .	21
1.6 Semantics for Logics that Have Static Proofs . . . . .	30
1.7 Classical Logic . . . . .	31
<b>2 Example: Handling Inconsistency</b>	<b>37</b>
2.1 A Paradigmatic Problem . . . . .	37
2.2 A Regular Paraconsistent Logic . . . . .	39
2.3 Enter Dynamics . . . . .	46
2.3.1 A Failing Strategy . . . . .	48
2.3.2 The Reliability Strategy . . . . .	52
2.3.3 The Minimal Abnormality Strategy . . . . .	55
2.3.4 The Predicative Cases . . . . .	58
2.3.5 Final Derivability . . . . .	58
2.4 Semantics . . . . .	59
2.5 The Classical Symbols . . . . .	60
2.6 Concluding Comments . . . . .	62
2.7 Appendix: Proof of Theorems 1.5.9 and 1.5.10 . . . . .	63
<b>3 Example: Inductive Generalization</b>	<b>69</b>
3.1 Promises . . . . .	69
3.2 A First Logic of Inductive Generalization . . . . .	71
3.3 Heuristic Matters and Further Comments . . . . .	77
3.4 Two Alternatives . . . . .	80
3.5 Combined Adaptive Logics . . . . .	86
3.6 Handling Background Knowledge . . . . .	97
3.7 Conjectures . . . . .	104
3.8 Some Comments in Conclusion . . . . .	106

<b>4</b>	<b>The Standard Format</b>	<b>109</b>
4.1	Introduction . . . . .	109
4.2	The Definition . . . . .	111
4.3	Excursion on the Classical Symbols . . . . .	116
4.4	Proofs . . . . .	119
4.5	Semantics . . . . .	124
4.6	The Upper Limit Logic . . . . .	125
4.7	Dynamic Proofs . . . . .	126
4.8	Adaptive Dynamic Proofs . . . . .	130
4.9	. . . and Dialogues . . . . .	131
4.9.1	Reliability . . . . .	133
4.9.2	Minimal Abnormality . . . . .	137
4.9.3	Excursion: Classical Disjunctions in <i>Dab</i> -formulas . . . . .	139
4.10	Dynamic Semantics . . . . .	140
4.11	Modifications to Adaptive Logics from Previous Chapters . . . . .	148
<b>5</b>	<b>Metatheory of The Standard Format</b>	<b>149</b>
5.1	Some Facts about Choice Sets . . . . .	150
5.2	Strong Reassurance . . . . .	154
5.3	Soundness and Completeness . . . . .	156
5.4	The Adequacy of Final Derivability . . . . .	159
5.5	Punctual Uniformity . . . . .	162
5.6	Some Further Properties . . . . .	165
5.7	Equivalent Premise Sets . . . . .	176
5.8	Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic . . . . .	182
5.9	Border Cases . . . . .	184
5.10	Some Negative Theorems . . . . .	187
<b>6</b>	<b>Strategies and Combinations</b>	<b>191</b>
6.1	Other Strategies . . . . .	191
6.1.1	Simple . . . . .	191
6.1.2	Blindness . . . . .	194
6.1.3	Normal Selections . . . . .	194
6.1.4	The Flip-flop Strategy . . . . .	196
6.1.5	Counting . . . . .	197
6.2	Combined Adaptive Logics . . . . .	200
6.2.1	Unions of Sets of Abnormalities . . . . .	201
6.2.2	Sequential Superpositions . . . . .	205
6.2.3	Examples and Metatheoretic Problems . . . . .	217
6.2.4	Closed Unions of Consequence Sets . . . . .	229
6.2.5	Ordered Fusions of Adaptive Logics . . . . .	237
<b>7</b>	<b>More Ways to Handle Inconsistency</b>	<b>241</b>
7.1	The Need for Variants . . . . .	241
7.2	Some More Regular Paraconsistent Logics . . . . .	242
7.3	The Corresponding Adaptive Logics . . . . .	247
7.4	As Normal As Possible . . . . .	255
7.5	Identifying Inconsistent Objects . . . . .	263

<b>8</b>	<b>Corrective Adaptive Logics</b>	<b>269</b>
8.1	Not Only Inconsistency-Adaptive Logics . . . . .	269
8.2	Variants and Combinations . . . . .	278
8.3	Ambiguity-Adaptive Logics . . . . .	283
8.4	Adaptive Zero Logic . . . . .	289
8.5	Strength of Paraconsistency and Ambiguity . . . . .	291
8.6	Flip-flop Criteria . . . . .	292
<b>9</b>	<b>Integration within the Adaptive Program</b>	<b>303</b>
9.1	Aim . . . . .	303
9.2	Compatibility . . . . .	304
9.3	Inconsistent Compatibility . . . . .	305
9.4	Integrating Normal Selections . . . . .	305
9.5	Integrating the Flip-flop Strategy . . . . .	306
9.6	Integrating Counting . . . . .	306
9.7	Rescher–Manor . . . . .	307
9.8	RM and their Enrichment . . . . .	308
9.8.1	Aim . . . . .	308
9.8.2	A Failure . . . . .	308
9.8.3	A Second Failure . . . . .	308
9.8.4	Other Proposal / Heuristic Considerations . . . . .	308
9.9	Direct Proofs . . . . .	310
9.10	Formula-Preferential Systems . . . . .	310
<b>10</b>	<b>Computational and Philosophical</b>	<b>311</b>
10.1	Computational Complexity . . . . .	311
10.2	Criteria for Final Derivability . . . . .	314
10.3	Criteria: Tableau Methods . . . . .	314
10.3.1	Tableaux for the Lower Limit Logic . . . . .	315
10.3.2	Tableaux for the Adaptive Logics . . . . .	317
10.4	Criteria: Proof Procedures . . . . .	326
10.4.1	Reliability . . . . .	327
10.4.2	Minimal Abnormality . . . . .	327
10.5	Reasoning in the Absence of a Criterion . . . . .	328
10.6	Interesting Open Problems . . . . .	328
	<b>References</b>	<b>329</b>
	Note on the Index	<b>339</b>
	<b>Index</b>	<b>340</b>
<b>A</b>	<b>afspraken Dirk + TE DOEN</b>	<b>349</b>
A.1	talen . . . . .	350
A.2	Add: Defeasible Reasoning and Adaptive Logics . . . . .	350
A.3	Urgent: REVISE . . . . .	350
A.4	NIET VERGETEN . . . . .	351
A.5	GP . . . . .	351

<b>B</b>	<b>Notes on Some Concepts *</b>	<b>353</b>
B.1	The Consequence Relation . . . . .	353
B.2	Proofs . . . . .	355
B.3	Semantics . . . . .	356
<b>C</b>	<b>Notes</b>	<b>357</b>
C.1	Consistency by Brute Force . . . . .	357
C.2	Extensional Logics . . . . .	357
C.3	Infinite proofs . . . . .	357
C.4	Troubles with $\Phi(\Gamma)$ . . . . .	358
C.4.1	Infinite extensions required . . . . .	358
C.4.2	Uncountable $\Phi(\Gamma)$ . . . . .	358
C.4.3	Need the proof be infinite? . . . . .	359
C.4.4	The Way Premise sets are Given . . . . .	361
C.4.5	Criteria for Uncountable $\Phi(\Gamma)$ . . . . .	361
C.5	Arguments for Inserting Lines . . . . .	363
C.6	Examples of Simple Defeasible Mechanisms . . . . .	363
C.7	Interpretation of Expectancies . . . . .	363
<b>D</b>	<b>More Notes</b>	<b>365</b>
D.1	Henkin and Compactness . . . . .	365
D.2	Prospective Dynamics and Axiom schemata . . . . .	366
D.3	Content-Guided Choice of an Adaptive Logic . . . . .	366
D.4	Adaptive Logics Defined by Rules . . . . .	368
D.5	Relation with argumentation . . . . .	368
<b>E</b>	<b>Verwijderd</b>	<b>369</b>
E.1	Idea behind the Technical Treatment . . . . .	369
E.2	Flip-flops: stuk uit flipflop-afdeling . . . . .	371
E.3	LP flip-flop / deels fout . . . . .	374
E.4	Tijdelijk . . . . .	375
E.5	Direct bewijs van Corr. 5.6.3 . . . . .	376
E.6	oude versie eigenschappen . . . . .	377