

**Adaptive Logics and Dynamic Proofs.**  
Mastering the Dynamics of Reasoning,  
with Special Attention to Handling Inconsistency.

Diderik Batens

March 1, 2010



# Contents

<b>Preface</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>7</b>
1.1 What is an Adaptive Logic? . . . . .	7
1.2 Dynamic Reasoning Forms . . . . .	12
1.3 Specific Features . . . . .	17
1.4 Languages . . . . .	19
1.5 Static Proofs . . . . .	21
1.6 Semantics for Logics that Have Static Proofs . . . . .	29
1.7 Classical Logic . . . . .	30
<b>2 Example: Handling Inconsistency</b>	<b>37</b>
2.1 A problem . . . . .	37
2.2 A Regular Paraconsistent Logic . . . . .	39
2.3 Enters Dynamics . . . . .	46
2.3.1 A Failing Strategy . . . . .	48
2.3.2 The Reliability Strategy . . . . .	52
2.3.3 The Minimal Abnormality Strategy . . . . .	55
2.3.4 The Predicative Cases . . . . .	57
2.3.5 Final Derivability . . . . .	58
2.4 Semantics . . . . .	59
2.5 The Classical Symbols . . . . .	60
2.6 Concluding Comments . . . . .	62
2.7 Appendix: Proof of Theorems 1.5.9 and 1.5.10 . . . . .	63
<b>3 Example: Inductive Generalization</b>	<b>67</b>
3.1 Promises . . . . .	67
3.2 A First Logic of Inductive Generalization . . . . .	69
3.3 Heuristic Matters and Further Comments . . . . .	75
3.4 Two Stronger Alternatives . . . . .	78
3.5 Combined Adaptive Logics . . . . .	84
3.6 Handling Background Knowledge . . . . .	95
3.7 Conjectures . . . . .	102
3.8 Some Comments in Conclusion . . . . .	104

<b>4</b>	<b>The Standard Format</b>	<b>107</b>
4.1	Introduction . . . . .	107
4.2	The Definition . . . . .	109
4.3	Excursion on the Classical Symbols . . . . .	114
4.4	Proofs . . . . .	116
4.5	Semantics . . . . .	120
4.6	The Upper Limit Logic . . . . .	121
4.7	Dynamic Proofs . . . . .	123
4.8	Adaptive Dynamic Proofs . . . . .	126
4.9	. . . and Dialogues . . . . .	127
	4.9.1 Reliability . . . . .	129
	4.9.2 Minimal Abnormality . . . . .	133
	4.9.3 Excursion: The Import of Classical Disjunction . . . . .	135
4.10	Dynamic Semantics . . . . .	136
4.11	Modifications to Adaptive Logics from Previous Chapters . . . . .	143
<b>5</b>	<b>Metatheory of The Standard Format</b>	<b>145</b>
5.1	Some Facts about Choice Sets . . . . .	146
5.2	Strong Reassurance . . . . .	149
5.3	Soundness and Completeness . . . . .	152
5.4	The Adequacy of Final Derivability . . . . .	154
5.5	Punctual Uniformity . . . . .	158
5.6	Some Further Properties . . . . .	161
5.7	Equivalent Premise Sets . . . . .	171
5.8	Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic . . . . .	176
5.9	Border Cases . . . . .	178
5.10	Some Negative Theorems . . . . .	181
<b>6</b>	<b>Combined Adaptive Logics</b>	<b>185</b>
6.1	Introduction and Preliminaries . . . . .	185
6.2	Unions of Sets of Abnormalities . . . . .	186
6.3	Union of Consequence Sets . . . . .	187
	6.3.1 Unions with Overlapping Sets of Abnormalities . . . . .	188
	6.3.2 Examples: <b>HIL</b> and <b>HG</b> . . . . .	189
6.4	Sequential Superpositions . . . . .	191
	6.4.1 Examples: <b>CIL*</b> and <b>CG*</b> . . . . .	192
	6.4.2 Examples: Degrees of Plausibility . . . . .	193
	6.4.3 Superpositions with Overlapping Sets of Abnormalities . . . . .	193
	6.4.4 Examples: <b>CIL</b> and <b>CG</b> . . . . .	194
6.5	Fusions of Adaptive Logics . . . . .	194
6.6	As Normal as Possible . . . . .	195
<b>7</b>	<b>More Ways to Handle Inconsistency</b>	<b>199</b>
7.1	The Need for Variants . . . . .	199
7.2	Some More Regular Paraconsistent Logics . . . . .	200
7.3	The Corresponding Adaptive Logics . . . . .	205
7.4	As Normal As Possible . . . . .	213
7.5	Identifying Inconsistent Objects . . . . .	221

<b>8</b>	<b>Corrective Adaptive Logics</b>	<b>225</b>
8.1	Not Only Inconsistency-Adaptive Logics . . . . .	225
8.2	Variants and Combinations . . . . .	234
8.3	Ambiguity-Adaptive Logics . . . . .	240
8.4	Adaptive Zero Logic . . . . .	246
8.5	Strength of Paraconsistency and Ambiguity . . . . .	247
8.6	Flip-flop Criteria . . . . .	248
<b>9</b>	<b>Integration within the Adaptive Program</b>	<b>261</b>
9.1	Formula-Preferential Systems . . . . .	261
9.2	Rescher–Manor . . . . .	261
9.3	RM and their Enrichment . . . . .	262
9.3.1	Aim . . . . .	262
9.3.2	A Failure . . . . .	262
9.3.3	A Second Failure . . . . .	263
9.3.4	Other Proposal / Heuristic Considerations . . . . .	263
9.4	Direct Proofs . . . . .	265
<b>10</b>	<b>Criteria for Final Derivability</b>	<b>267</b>
10.1	Criteria for Final Derivability . . . . .	267
<b>A</b>	<b>Notes on Some Concepts *</b>	<b>271</b>
A.1	The Consequence Relation . . . . .	271
A.2	Proofs . . . . .	273
A.3	Semantics . . . . .	274
<b>B</b>	<b>Notes</b>	<b>275</b>
B.1	Consistency by Brute Force . . . . .	275
B.2	Extensional Logics . . . . .	275
B.3	Infinite proofs . . . . .	275
B.4	Troubles with $\Phi(\Gamma)$ . . . . .	276
B.4.1	Infinite extensions required . . . . .	276
B.4.2	Uncountable $\Phi(\Gamma)$ . . . . .	276
B.4.3	Need the proof be infinite? . . . . .	277
B.4.4	The Way Premise sets are Given . . . . .	279
B.4.5	Criteria for Uncountable $\Phi(\Gamma)$ . . . . .	279
B.5	Arguments for Inserting Lines . . . . .	281
B.6	Examples of Simple Defeasible Mechanisms . . . . .	281
B.7	Interpretation of Expectancies . . . . .	281
<b>C</b>	<b>More Notes</b>	<b>283</b>
C.1	Henkin and Compactness . . . . .	283
C.2	Prospective Dynamics and Axiom schemata . . . . .	284
C.3	Content-Guided Choice of an Adaptive Logic . . . . .	284
C.4	Adaptive Logics Defined by Rules . . . . .	286
C.5	Relation with argumentation . . . . .	286

<b>D</b>	<b>Verwijderd</b>	<b>287</b>
D.1	Idea behind the Technical Treatment . . . . .	287
D.2	Flip-flops: stuk uit flipflop-afdeling . . . . .	289
D.3	LP flip-flop / deels fout . . . . .	292
D.4	Tijdelijk . . . . .	293
D.5	Direct bewijs van Corr. 5.6.3 . . . . .	294
D.6	oude versie eigenschappen . . . . .	295
<b>E</b>	<b>afspraken Dirk + TE DOEN</b>	<b>297</b>
E.1	talen . . . . .	297
E.2	Add: Defeasible Reasoning and Adaptive Logics . . . . .	298
E.3	Urgent: REVISE . . . . .	298
E.4	NIET VERGETEN . . . . .	298
E.5	GP . . . . .	299
	<b>References</b>	<b>299</b>
	Note on the Index	<b>309</b>
	<b>Index</b>	<b>310</b>